PILDAT RULE OF LAW REFORM SERIES

MEDIA BRIEF

POLICING AND MEDIA IN PAKISTAN

FEBRUARY 2016



Legislative Development And Transparency

MEDIA BRIEF

POLICING AND MEDIA IN PAKISTAN

FEBRUARY 2016



Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development And Transparency PILDAT is an independent, non-partisan and not-for-profit indigenous research and training institution with the mission to strengthen democracy and democratic institutions in Pakistan.

PILDAT is a registered non-profit entity under the Societies Registration Act XXI of 1860, Pakistan.

Copyright © Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development And Transparency - PILDAT

All Rights Reserved

Printed in Pakistan

Published: February 2016

ISBN: 978-969-558-599-3

Any part of this publication can be used or cited with a clear reference to PILDAT.



Islamabad Office: P. O. Box 278, F-8, Postal Code: 44220, Islamabad, Pakistan Lahore Office: P. O. Box 11098, L.C.C.H.S, Postal Code: 54792, Lahore, Pakistan E-mail: info@pildat.org | Website: www.pildat.org

PILDAT Media Brief Policing and Media in Pakistan

February 2016

09

CONTENTS

Abbreviation and Acronyms Foreword Current State of Policing in Pakistan

Challenges in Police Service Delivery	09
Policy Recommendations and Way Forward	09
What Can the Media Do?	1(
Regional and International Media – Police Experiences	11
Recommended Reading	

PILDAT Media Brief. Policing and Media in Pakistan

February 2016

Abbreviations and Acronyms

CJS	Criminal Justice System
PO 2002	Police Order 2002
CJCCs	Criminal Justice Coordination Committees
Cr.P.C	Code of Criminal Procedure 1898
PPC	Pakistan Penal Code
ATA	Anti Terrorism Act
ISAC	Intelligence Sharing and Analysis Centres
ISI	Inter Services Intelligence
IB	Intelligence Bureau
ISPR	Inter Services Public Relations
SMPs	Specialised Mobile Patrols
СТ	Counter Terrorism
FIA	Federal Investigation Agency
SB	Special Branch
CTD	Counter Terrorism Department
ACPO	Association of Chief of Police Officers

PILDAT Media Brief Policing and Media in Pakistan

February 2016

Preface

PILDAT has initiated a national and provincial level legislative and policy advocacy effort to bring reforms in the area of Police, Prosecution and Free Legal Aid in Pakistan.

This media brief is a compilation of proposed reforms originating from PILDAT's Consultative Sessions held at the Federal and Provincial level on strengths and weaknesses in the Police System in Pakistan.

The Media Brief benefits from research conducted by **Mr. Muhammad Ali Nekokara**, former Senior Superintendent of Police, and has been published by PILDAT under the "Reforms in Police, Prosecution and Legal Aid Service" project for which it has received support from the Development Alternates Inc. (DAI) under the Enhanced Democratic Accountability and Civic Engagement (EDACE) project.

Disclaimer

The reform proposals contained in this brief do not necessarily represent the views of the Development Alternates Inc. (DAI).

Islamabad February 2016

PILDAT Media Brief..... Policing and Media in Pakistan

February 2016

Current State of Policing in Pakistan

In Pakistan, the crisis of law and order has worsened over the years. The primary law enforcing agency of Pakistan – the Police -- has been deemed as incapable of managing its obligations, especially in overcoming serious crimes and combating terrorism. The Police in Pakistan suffer from much criticism for their inefficiency, public dealing, and are often accused of corruption and politicization. Negative perception of police among the general public and the media is a major concern for officers themselves.

Since independence, there has been **no real or significant progress in reforming and restructuring the police system inherited from colonial times** except the democratic Police Order 2002 which was ironically introduced under a military regime replacing the colonial Police Act 1861. That move also failed to achieve the desired outcome owing to the opposition from provincial political executives and the bureaucracy and lack of leadership on part of police leaders. Importantly, the reform efforts have avoided responding to core policing deficits such as in training, police station responsiveness, investigations and broadly in management and leadership.

Challenges in Police Service Delivery

Key problems afflicting the country's police system include:

- I. Weaknesses in Police Governance Structure, Criminal Laws, Procedures and Evidence Act including implementation challenges
- ii. Inadequate financial support
- iii. Lack of collaboration amongst law enforcement departments/agencies
- iv. Lack of focus on core police unit-Police Stations
- v. Training deficit in terms of developing specialized skills such as investigations, operations/tactics, soft skills etc.
- vi. Understrength police and low representation of women in police
- vii. Welfare, equipment and logistics issues
- viii. Adversarial Interaction with Judiciary, Lawyers, Media & Pressure Groups

Policy Recommendations and Way Forward

It is crucial to re-organise Police so that it may become

A case in point is the Police Order of 2002, promulgated on 14 August 2002, which replaced the more than century-old Police Act of 1861 in all four provinces of Pakistan. This promulgation does not extend to the Islamabad Capital Territory (ICT), Gilgit-Baltistan (GB) or Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK)

politically neutral, non-authoritarian, accountable and easily accessible and responsive to the citizens, and, last but not least, an effective instrument of Rule of Law. The following strategic policy and institutional reforms coupled with political will and strong-minded police leadership can help develop an efficient and fair police in the country:

- i. Amend Criminal Procedure and Pakistan Penal Codes, Evidence Act 1984 and Anti-Terrorism Act 1997;
- ii. Effective implementation of PO 2002, with appropriate amendments, is required to improve police performance;
- iii. **Increase police budget** across Federal and Provincial Spheres at par at least with the Indian Punjab (US \$15.9 per capita per annum) over the next 3 years;
- iv. Integrated **collaboration amongst police and intelligence agencies** such as Inter-Services Intelligence (ISI) and Intelligence Bureau (IB) in the provinces down to district level is crucial to counter terrorism, fight organised crime and maintain order and security;
- v. Police should have **direct professional** engagement with the media and civil society to highlight police version and improve police image;
- vi. Leaders of the system should engage each other and exercise leadership to **integrate prosecutors with police investigators** in carefully planned and sequenced interventions starting with facilitative legal guidance by prosecutors for police investigators and eventually empowering them to decide on fitness to prosecute offences;
- vii. Specialised training schools such as Criminal Investigations, Intelligence & Surveillance,

PILDAT Media Brief. *Policing and Media in Pakistan*

February 2016

Public Disorder & Riot Management, Explosives Handling, Tactics & Execution of Operations and Information Technology, as established in KP, should be established in other provinces also to develop expertise in specialised police roles;

- viii. **Increase police numbers by 10% annually** to bring the police-population ratio eventually at par with the international standards;
- ix. Increase women representation in police annually to bring it from current 1% of total police strength to 10% eventually;
- x. Replace static, inefficient and counter intuitive police stop/search pickets with random **Specialised Mobile Patrols (SMPs)** equipped with a database of criminals and stolen vehicles to carry out random stop/search in targeted areas under the supervision of at least an Assistant Sub Inspector;
- xi. Introduce a) forensic support for investigators; b) investigation teams and specialized squads for serious and organised crimes; and, c) crime scene units in each district;
- xii. **Terrorist Finance Investigative Units** existing already in FIA must be made functional and expanded to provinces;
- xiii. **Conflict resolution** -- though essentially a political role -- yet police, being more of a peacekeeper rather than law enforcer in practice, needs to develop these skills since extremism and CT are connected to religious, sectarian and ethnic conflicts;
- xiv. Focus on **urban policing** by adopting smart and inclusive policing practices such as crime pattern and data analysis and community policing;
- xv. A **Crime Survey** on the model of British Crime Survey may be introduced with special focus on understanding the level of cattle theft and street crime in the rural areas of Punjab and Sindh;
- xvi. Inspectors General of Police with more operational autonomy need to establish integrated police intelligence sharing structures where information from field units, SB and CTD is shared with each other to create multiplier effect in prevention and detection of crime and order maintenance;
- xvii. Disciplinary rules must be reviewed to introduce 'Discipline Matrix' to make the disciplinary proceedings fair and consistent;
- xviii. A consultative and action oriented arrangement like Association of Chief of Police Officers (ACPO) of England & Wales is the need of the hour to develop professionally organised and legitimate police response.

What Can the Media Do?

- i. As an effective watchdog, **expose the abuse of power** by police and the political executive and organizational ineffectiveness;
- ii. As an agenda-setter, **raise awareness to increase demand for reforms** and to make the political executive, police and other relevant authorities responsive to their roles;
- As a gate keeper and public forum for diverse perspectives, promote inclusive and informed debate and help in sound decision making and problem solving;
- iv. Highlight contributions of hard-working, honest police officers of all ranks who are working with commitment including willingness and demonstrated ability to give up their lives to protect the citizens and their country against criminals and terrorists. Sacrifices of police martyrs such as Safwat Ghayuur, Malik Saad, Chaudary Aslam and hundreds of others need to be remembered to raise the morale of police, provide emotional strength to the families of the martyrs and improve police-public relations;
- v. Balance coverage of serious violent crimes, which constitute only 10% of the total recorded crime, in the print and electronic media that increases fear of crime amongst the citizens;
- vi. Balance reporting of police and crime with analysis of causes and possible responses;
- vii. Effectively condemn extra judicial coercive measures by police and mob justice;
- viii. Raise awareness on issues of social importance including police reforms and help the policy makers in understanding the interests and concerns of the people;
- ix. Highlighting social needs such as efficient police and security through media and linking policy makers with public concern help in improving policy responses;
- x. Raise awareness regarding the issues and need for police reforms, such as, a) standardized democratic governance structure for police and its implementation in all four provinces, b) adequate financial support to improve police capacity, c) working collaboration amongst law enforcement departments and agencies to counter terrorism, organized and serious crimes, d) specialized police training, refresher courses and reasonable budgetary allocations for the purpose, and e) aligning the police station through intensive engagement, supervision and support etc;

10

PILDAT Media Brief Policing and Media in Pakistan

February 2016

- xi. Build capacity of journalists covering police and criminal justice issues so that they can perform their watchdog, agenda setter and gatekeeper roles vis-a-vis police reforms more effectively;
- xii. Media owners, editors and senior journalists may provide support by encouraging the journalists -especially investigative journalists -- to analyse in depth and report on various aspects of police reforms more frequently;
- xiii. CSOs can facilitate the media in building capacity of journalists on police and criminal justice issues and providing support in research, raising awareness and campaigning for specific cases and interventions;
- xiv. Executive, legislators and police leaders need to be asked specific questions both in the print and electronic media regarding police reforms, such as, about reversal of democratic police law – police Order 2002 in Sindh and Balochistan, poor implementation of Police Order 2002 in Punjab, hopelessly insufficient budgetary support for police training, operations and investigations;
- xv. Media must **train and encourage journalists to use the Right to Information law** frequently and persistently and play the watchdog role effectively;
- xvi. In areas of low literacy, television and radio are more effective means to educate people about issues and need of police reforms and to increase public demand for democratic police reforms.

Regional and International Media – Police Experiences

In **India**, watchdog activism amongst the media and its collaboration with the civil society is seemingly stronger as reflected in the movie *No one Killed Jessica* based on a real story in which Rani Mukerji in the role of a television journalist and supported effectively by the civil society exposes the collusively corrupt conduct of police and politics. The media-civil society activism generated awareness and moved authorities successfully to rectify the injustice meted out in Jessica's case earlier at the trial court through guilty verdicts successively in the High Court and the Supreme Court of India.

In the **U.K.** in an unprovoked racist attack Stephen Lawrence, black teenage student, was murdered by five white males in London 0n April 22, 1993. The case engaged British media for almost six years with varying intensity. On February 14, 1997 the *Daily Mail* Executive, legislators and police leaders need to be asked specific questions both in the print and electronic media regarding police reforms, such as, about reversal of democratic police law – police Order 2002 in Sindh and Balochistan, poor implementation of Police Order 2002 in Punjab, hopelessly insufficient budgetary support for police training, operations and investigations

ran five pictures of white men on the front page with the caption: "*The Mail accuses these men of killing. If we are wrong let them sue us*". Jack Straw the Home Secretary ordered an inquiry, which led to Macpherson Report in 1999 accompanied by wide media coverage. The report blamed police for professional incompetence, institutional racism and a failure of leadership by senior officers. The Macpherson report made 70 recommendations – 67 of which led to specific changes in practice or the law within two years of its publication.

PILDAT Media Brief..... Policing and Media in Pakistan

February 2016

Recommended Reading

Position Paper on Police System in Pakistan 1. Online in English at: http://www.pildat.org/Publications/publication/ROLR/PoliceSystemofPakistan PositionPaper.pdf In Urdu at: http://www.pildat.org/Publications/publication/ROLR/PoliceSystemofPakistan PositionPaper Urdu.pdf In Sindhi at: http://www.pildat.org/Publications/publication/ROLR/PoliceSystemofPakistan PositionPaper Sindhi.pdf Position Paper on Police Order 2002: Critical Analysis and Constitutional Debate 2. Online in English at: http://www.pildat.org/Publications/publication/ROLR/PoliceOrder2002CriticalAnalysisandConstitutionalDebat eDec2015 PositionPaper.pdf In Urdu at: http://www.pildat.org/Publications/publication/ROLR/PoliceOrder2002CriticalAnalysisandConstitutionalDebat eDec2015 PositionPaper urdu.pdf In Sindhi at: http://www.pildat.org/Publications/publication/ROLR/PoliceOrder2002CriticalAnalysisandConstitutionalDebat eDec2015_PositionPaper_sindhi.pdf Legislative Brief on Punjab Police Order (Amendment) Act 2013 3 Online in English at: http://www.pildat.org/Publications/publication/ROLR/LB24 PunjabPoliceOrder Amendment Act2013.pdf In Urdu at: http://www.pildat.org/Publications/publication/ROLR/LB24_PunjabPoliceOrder_Amendment_Act2013_urdu.p df In Sindhi at: http://www.pildat.org/Publications/publication/ROLR/LB24 PunjabPoliceOrder Amendment Act2013 Sindhi. pdf Policy Brief: Policy Recommendations for Reforms in Police System of Pakistan 4. Online in English at: http://www.pildat.org/Publications/publication/ROLR/PolicyRecommendationsforReformsinPoliceSystemofPak istan.pdf In Urdu at: http://www.pildat.org/Publications/publication/ROLR/PolicyRecommendationsforReformsinPoliceSystemofPak istan Urdu.pdf No One Killed Jessica, Times of India, February 22, 2006, accessed on 1 January, 2016 at <u>http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/city/delhi/No-one-killed-Jessica/articleshow/1423393.cmshttp://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/city/delhi/No-one-killed-</u> 5. Jessica/articleshow/1423393.cms Mustaf Kanju among all 5 suspects acquitted in Zain's murder case, The News International, Pakistan, October 6 27, 2015, accessed on January 1, 2016 at http://www.thenews.com.pk/latest/9407-mustafa-kanju-among-all-5suspects-acquitted-in-zain-murder-case Sina Odugbemi and Pippa Norris, Do the News Media Act as watchdogs, agenda setter and gate keeper, Role of 7. Media in Governance Reforms, Edited: Pippa Norris, World Bank, Washington DC, accessed on January 2, 2016 at http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/TOPICS/EXTDEVCOMMENG/EXTGOVACC/0,,contentM DK:22343085~page. 8. Shahzeb Khan's killers pardoned by family, Dawn, September 9, 2013, accessed on January 6, 2016, http://wwdawn.com/news/1041654 <u>Mustafa Kanju's acquittal: Supreme Court refers Zain murder case back to LHC</u>, Express Tribune, Pakistan, http://tribune.com.pk/story/995006/mustafa-kanjus-acquittal-supreme-court-refers-zain-murder-case-back-to-9. lhc/ 10. Sina Odugbemi and Pippa Norris, Do the News Media Act as watchdogs, agenda setter and gatekeeper, Role of Media in Governance Reforms, Public Sentinel, News Media and Governance Reform, Edited by Pippa Norris,

World Bank, Washington DC, accessed on January 2, 2016 at http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/TOPICS/EXTDEVCOMMENG/EXTGOVACC/0,,contentM DK:22343085~page.

For more information, please visit: www.pildat.org | www.facebook.com/PILDAT/ @PILDAT | @RoLPakistan | #RuleOfLawPakistan

12







Islamabad Office: P.O.Box 278, F-8, Postal Code: 44220. Islamabad, Pakistan Lahore Office: P.O.Box 11098, L.C.C.H.S, Postal Code: 54792, Lahore, Pakistan E: Info@pildat.org | www.pildat.org Twitter: @pildat | @rolpakistan