

MONITOR

Quality of Governance in Pakistan

June-July 2015



In this Issue

Budget 2015-2016 Announced Amidst Last Year's Missed Targets	03
The Year of Local Government Elections in Pakistan; 2015	05
National Defense	06
i. Pakistan Army Celebrates One-Year Anniversary of Zarb-e-Azb	06
ii. Punjab Government Committed to Curbing Terror Financing	07
iii. LeJ Leader Malik Ishaq Killed in Police Encounter	07
Peace Stability and Order	08
i. I-II Kachi Abbadi Eviction in Islamabad Sparks Debate	08
Promotions and Recruitments	08
i. Aitchison Principal Sacked for Rejecting Admissions	08
ii. Merit Being Ignored in Foreign Posting of Trade Officers	09
Disaster Preparedness and Management	10
i. NDMA Efforts in on-going Monsoon Floods	10
ii. Karachi Heat Wave	11
Performance of Regulatory Bodies	11
i. Crackdown Against Eateries Continues in Punjab	11

Third Year of the Current Federal and Provincial Governments: June 1, 2015-May 31, 2016 **Major Developments Affecting Quality of Governance in Pakistan during June-July 2015**

The PILDAT Governance Monitor attempts to delineate the various positive and negative developments during June 2015-July 2015 that have affected the quality of governance in Pakistan during this period.

Budget 2015-2016 Announced Amidst Last Year's Missed Targets

Taking stock of developments related to the Federal Budget for 2015-2016 announced by the Finance Minister, Senator Muhammad Ishaq Dar on June 5 2015, PILDAT has noted that the overall budget size (Rs. 4451.3 billion) has increased by 3.5% since last year; out of which 78% is envisaged for current expenditures and 22% for development expenditure. Table 1 gives a break down of the current expenditures for FY 2015-2016. Additionally, the net revenue receipts are estimated to be 10.7% more than the budget estimates of 2014-2015.



Finance Minister Ishaq Dar announced 2015-2016 Budget in a Speech in the National Assembly. Express Tribune

While appreciating the allocations worth Rs. 20 billion on projects related to higher education, the proposed expenditure of education in the Budget 2015-2016 is only 1.67%,¹ which is considerably below the target of 4% set for the year 2017-2018. It is also important to consider that after the 18th Amendment, education has been devolved to the provinces, which means that the Provincial Governments will have to become more active in the Education Sector to achieve the set target of education expenditure.

Another interesting allocation is the Rs.20 billion set aside for achieving Millennium Development Goals and the Community Development Programme. The question arises whether these allocations are meaningful and able to fulfill development goals set for the year 2015-2016 or are merely eleventh-hour increases to act as 'untied funds' since there are only six months left in the MDG's deadline; December 31, 2015.

The Budget 2015-2016 has allocated Rs.102 billion to the Benazir Income Support Programme (BISP), which is a welcome increase of 5.2% from the previous allocation of Rs. 97 billion. Increased spending on BISP, Prime Minister's Youth Loan Scheme, Income Tax Reliefs and a 7.5% increase in pay and pension of governments servants are some decisions taken by the federal government; geared towards alleviating poverty.

Amidst these developments and Government's claims of a pro-poor budget, the unveiling of the Economic Survey 2014-2015 reveals several missed targets for FY 2014-2015, which includes the 5.1 % growth rate target.² This year the Government aims to achieve 5.5% growth rate. It is needless to say that the Government should exercise greater prudence by setting achievable and realistic goals. Additionally, Pakistan's Tax-to-GDP ratio declined in FY 2014-2015 from 10.2% to

1. Highlights of Pakistan's Budget,"Pak Economy: <http://www.opfblog.com/23242/highlights-of-pakistan-budget-2015-16/>. Accessed on 18/08/2015
2. Pakistan Economic Survey: Two Years of Growth and Several Missed Targets," DAWN Webpage: <http://www.dawn.com/news/1186172> . Accessed on 18/8/2015

7.5% despite government efforts to widen the tax base through structural reforms. For the FY 2015-2016 the Federal Government seems determined to institute tax reforms to increase tax revenue collection. New taxes worth Rs.253 billion are to be exercised in the FY 2015-2016 in order to achieve the target of Rs. 3.1 trillion which is rather ambitious and a significant jump from budget of FY 2014-2015, approximately 19%.³

A significant proportion of the Budget has also been allocated to the Energy Sector i.e. Rs. 248 billion,⁴ however there is no clear strategy in place to deal with the burgeoning problem of circular debt.⁵ Moreover, the Budget only caters to the Power Sector, with no development allocations for the Gas and Oil Sectors as well as projects like the Iran-Pakistan Gas Pipeline.⁶ The Prime Minister is committed to exploring alternate sources of clean energy and in order to fulfill that commitment the Government has allocated approximately Rs.52 billion for the Dasu Hydropower Project. Another Rs.21 billion has been allocated to the construction of the Diamir Basha Dam, Rs.11 billion for Nelum Jhelum Hydropower and another Rs.11 billion for the Tarbela IV-Extension Hydropower Project. These allocations are intended to significantly increase the power generation capacity of the country and they reflect the current PML-N Government's strong commitment to pursuing environment friendly, low cost energy production. PILDAT believes this focus on environment friendly energy generation will pave the way for achieving sustainable development goals.⁷

Table 1: Current Expenditure Break Down for FY 2015-2016

Current Expenditures	Billion (Rs.)	Percentage of Current
General Public Service*	2,446.6	70.26%
Defense Affairs & Services	781.2	23.00%
Public Order and Safety Services	95	3.00%
Education Affairs & Services	75.5	2.00%
Economic Affairs**	60.2	1.70%
Health Affairs & Services	11	0.30%
Recreation, Culture & Religion	7.6	0.20%
Housing and Community Amenities	2.3	0.07%
Social Protection	1.8	0.05%
Environment Protection	1.0	0.03%
Total Current	3482.2	100%

*Includes expenses relating to the organization and operation of government such as those related to the Parliament, the Governor-General and conduct of elections; the collection of taxes and the management of public funds and public debt.

**This includes agriculture, food, irrigation, forestry & fishing, fuel & energy, mining & manufacturing, construction & transportation, communication.

3. "Federal Budget Focuses on Taxation," Dailynewspak Webpage: <http://www.dailynewspak.com/federal-budget-2015-16-focuses-on-taxation/> . Accessed on 18/8/2015.
4. "Rs.1513.7 bn E2015-2016 approved," Pakistan Federal Budget. Accessed on 13/8/2015: <http://budget.par.com.pk/news/rs1513-7-bn-budget-2015-2016-approved/>
5. "Budget 2015-2016:Text of Ishaq Dar's Budget Speech." The Express Tribune: . Accessed on 13/8/2015
6. "Budget 2015-2016 Highlights," <http://hamariweb.com/finance/Pakistan-Federal-Budget-2015-16.aspx>
7. "Minister lauds allocations for environmental, energy issues." The Nation: <http://nation.com.pk/islamabad/07-Jun-2015/minister-lauds-allocations-for-environmental-energy-issues> . Accessed on 13/8/2015

The Year of Local Government Elections in Pakistan; 2015

On June 29, 2015 the National Assembly passed the Islamabad Capital Territory (ICT) Local Government Bill 2015, paving way for Local Government elections in Islamabad. The first ever local Government elections in Islamabad were previously scheduled for July 25, 2015 but were postponed indefinitely in the absence of the pending legislation; Islamabad Capital Territory Local Government Act.

This is a welcome development after the prolonged delay by the Federal Government in instituting a Local Government setup, despite the fact that the 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Pakistan has made it mandatory.

Article 140(A) of the Constitution explicitly states, "*Each Province shall, by law, establish a local government system and devolve political, administrative, and financial responsibility and authority to the elected representatives of the local governments.*" Moreover, sub-clause 2 of the same article stipulates, "*Election to the local governments shall be held by the Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP)*"⁸



Women Casting their Votes in LG Polls in DI Khan. Express Tribune

Additionally, re-polling on 358 polling stations in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) took place on July 30, 2015 in which the ruling party in KP; Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaaf (PTI) emerged victorious; securing 255 seats followed by independent candidates who secured 133 slots. The Awami National Party (ANP) came in third; securing a total of 101 seats, in KP local body elections.⁹ The Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP) has surpassed expectations by ensuring smooth execution of polls.¹⁰ This is a welcome development after the sub-par performance by ECP in May, 2015 when significant irregularities and acts of mismanagement were observed. PILDAT commends the law enforcing agencies, ECP and the general public in KP for ensuring peaceful re-polling in the province.

It is also important to note that the earlier, Local Government polls were temporarily delayed in Punjab and Sindh on the pretext of heavy flooding in the region. In a recent development this week, the Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP) has decided to hold first phase of Local Government elections in Sindh and Punjab on October 10, 2015. The schedule is to be announced later this week. PILDAT is hopeful that this announcement will come to maturity, as scheduled by the ECP. Additionally, rules and regulations need to be established that facilitate effective local governance arrangements through adequate devolution of fiscal, political and administrative power to local councils.

In another recent development the Punjab Government promulgated the Punjab Local Government (Amendment) Ordinance on July 17, 2015.¹¹ The Amendment has been heavily criticized on the grounds that it is promoting indirect elections. The issue raised is that the Government is deliberately preventing people from directly electing candidates on reserved seats for women, minorities and others. According to the Punjab Government¹² this Ordinance has been enacted so that it will simplify election procedures and reduce expenditure by cutting down on the ballot papers needed for direct voting of members for general seats.

-
8. "Local Government Acts 2013 and Provincial-Local Government Relations," UNDP Webpage: http://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/library/hiv_aids/development-advocate-pakistan/local-government-acts-2013-and-province-local-government-relatio.html . Accessed on 13/8/2015
 9. "Ruling PTI way ahead in KP Polls," The Nation. June 01 2015. <http://nation.com.pk/national/01-Jun-2015/ruling-pti-way-ahead-in-kp-polls>. Accessed on 18/08/2015.
 10. "PTI in the lead as local govt re-polls close in KP," The Express Tribune: <http://tribune.com.pk/story/929684/pti-in-the-lead-as-local-govt-re-polls-come-to-a-close-in-k-p/> . Accessed on 13/8/2015
 11. "Local government elections: Punjab 'smartly' changes poll rules," The Express Tribune: <http://tribune.com.pk/story/926563/local-government-elections-punjab-smartly-changes-poll-rules/>
 12. Ibid

PILDAT believes this rule should be revisited in order to ensure that marginalized groups and minorities have Local Government representation by enabling direct elections. Moreover it is prudent for Provincial Governments to recalibrate the rules and procedures of local governance, by focusing less on centralization of Government functions for the sake of political expediency and more on acting in accordance with the true nature of the 18th Amendment; which intends to empower Local Government structures.

National Defense

Pakistan Army Celebrates One-Year Anniversary of Zarb-e-Azb



SSG Commando in North Waziristan during Zarb-e-Azb Operation. AFP

June 15, 2015 marked the completion of one year of the Zarb-e-Azb operation undertaken by the Pakistani Military against the militants in North Waziristan. The Military Officials have termed Zarb-e-Azb a resounding success and the primary contributor to the significant drop in acts of terrorism in Pakistan. According to statistics reported by the South Asian Terrorism Portal, civilian casualties from terrorist violence are in decline: dropping 40 per cent in 2014 — the year the operation was launched — to 65 per cent in 2015.¹³ Moreover, 2,763 terrorists have been killed, 837 militants' hideouts destroyed and 253 tonnes of explosives recovered so far.¹⁴

PILDAT commends the success of the operation, which is considered to be a major 'game-changer' with regards to problems of militancy and security, however as PILDAT had noted in its Monitor on Civil-Military Relations¹⁵ in Pakistan for the first two years of the Federal Government, there are concerns regarding the absence of a civil set-up which can effectively govern the area after the military has done its part. Moreover, as noted earlier by PILDAT,¹⁶ the continued dormancy of the National Security Council (NSC) is inhibiting its potential to provide systematic oversight over the Zarb-e-Azb operation. Despite the comprehensive plan that has been chalked out by the Pakistan Army for resettlement of Temporarily Displaced Persons there is lack of civil participation in the process. The Military and the Civil Government need to collaborate effectively to implement and ensure dignified and protected repatriation of displaced persons. Additionally, the positive role played by media while covering details of the operation is noteworthy. The common themes of discussion emerging from media reports on Zarb-e-Azb have been objective and purposive, reflecting media's maturity and sense of support for the country's armed forces in undertaking the operation.¹⁷

While it is important to take stock of the success of the operation, in the aftermath of this positive development, it is equally important to consider future steps the State and Society need to take, to completely uproot terror from Pakistan in order to uphold and strengthen governance structures in place.¹⁸

13. "Zarb-e-Azab Year One," Asad Rahim Khan. The Express Tribune: <http://tribune.com.pk/story/901942/zarb-e-azab-year-one/>. Accessed on 13/8/2015

14. "Zarb-e-Azab findings and conclusions," The News on Sunday: <http://tns.thenews.com.pk/zarb-e-azab-one-year-on-findings-and-conclusions/#.Vb3UEJOqqko>

15. For Details see Monitor on Civil-Military Relations, Second Year of the Federal Government. Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development and Transparency (PILDAT).

16. For Details see Monitor on Civil-Military Relations in Pakistan in July 2015. Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development and Transparency (PILDAT).

17. "Media Maturity in Zarb-e-Azb," The Nation. <http://nation.com.pk/national/13-Aug-2014/media-maturity-in-zarb-e-azb>. Accessed on 19/8/2015.

18. "Zarb-e-Azb and Beyond," Waqar K Kauravi, The NEWS. June 18 2015. <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-9-324307-Zarb-e-Azb-and-beyond>

Punjab Government Committed to Curbing Terror Financing

Another welcome development on the peace and order front is the recent initiative taken by the Punjab Police to curb terror financing. Cases have been registered against Al-Rasheed Trust (Maymar Trust) and Al-Rehmat Trust in Multan, Ansarul Ummah, Sipa-i-Sahaba and Tehreek-i-Ghulbai-i-Islam in Bahawalpur and Jaish-e-Muhammad in Gujranwala.¹⁹ The hands-on approach of booking banned organizations for illegal fund transfers and acquisitions, recently displayed by the Government; can be attributed to the Anti-Money Laundering Bill (Amendment) 2014 which has given greater powers to Investigating Officials and enhanced the scope of suspected transactions to include all kinds of domestic and international flow of funds.²⁰ In an attempt to improve existing laws, under the new amendment, financial institutions are obligated to report suspicious transactions to the Financial Monitoring Unit within seven days.²¹

The efforts and commitment of the Law Enforcement Agencies and the Government to combat terrorism financing are laudable and PILDAT commends efforts to dismantle terrorist financial networks.²² The task ahead is stupendous but this is a step in the right direction with the ultimate aim of completely rooting out terrorism in the country.

LeJ Leader Malik Ishaq Killed in Police Encounter

Additionally, the commitment to eliminate terrorism from the cities, has improved the performance of the Counter Terrorism Department (CTD), which has become extremely active, lately. It recently detained Malik Ishaq, leader of the banned sunni group lakshare jhangvi, believed to have killed hundreds of Pakistani Shiites, along with his two sons. Ishaq was on the US list of global "terrorists" and had been imprisoned from 1997 to 2011, accused for 60 different criminal cases, however he was never prosecuted. This elucidates the cracks in Pakistan's Judicial System whereby militant leaders are able to intimidate judges²³ and political leaders and evade convictions. According to the police account, Ishaq and his two sons were being moved between detention



Malik Ishaq was taken into judicial remand by the Punjab Government in December 2014.

centers when a group of armed militants attacked the convoy in an attempt to free him. The crossfire that ensued between the CTD police and the militants killed Ishaq, his two sons and 11 others.²⁴ There are some speculations that the Zarb-e-Azab operation has been extended to the cities to eliminate miscreants hiding among local populations.²⁵ Some political analysts are also of the view that the success of the Zarb-e-Azab is

19. "Banned Outfits Collecting Funds Booked, Punjab tells SC," Nasir Iqbal. July 30 2015. DAWN Webpage: <http://www.dawn.com/news/1197226>
20. "Government proposes law to curb terror financing," Irfan Ghauri. The Express Tribune: <http://tribune.com.pk/story/815499/govt-proposes-law-to-curb-terror-financing/>
21. Ibid
22. "Curbing Terrorism," Daily Times: <http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/editorial/28-Dec-2014/curbing-terrorism> . Accessed on 13/8/2015.
23. "Malik Ishaq, Anti-Shiite Leader in Pakistan, Is Killed Trying to Escape, Authorities say," The New York Times: http://www.nytimes.com/2015/07/30/world/asia/malik-ishaq-leader-of-lashkar-e-jhangvi-militant-group-in-pakistan-is-said-to-die-in-attack-on-police-convoy.html?partner=rss&emc=rss&_r=0 . Accessed on 13/8/2015.
24. "Pakistan police kill leader of Lakshar-e-Jhangvi group," Aljazeera webpage: <http://www.aljazeera.com/news/2015/07/pakistan-police-kill-leader-lashkar-jhangvi-group-150729044020252.html> . Accessed on 13/8/2015.
25. "LeJ Leader, two sons, 12 other militants killed," DAWN Webpage: <http://www.dawn.com/news/1197227> . Accessed on 13/8/2015.

dependent on eliminating militants and jihadis from the cities; extermination of terrorist from tribal areas alone is not going to completely root out terrorism from the country.²⁶ If extended to cities, civil leadership and law enforcement agencies could become more involved in the operation.

Peace, Order and Stability

I-II Kachi Abbadi Eviction in Islamabad Sparks Debate



Local residents try to stop bulldozers during the anti-encroachment operation at I-II Afghan Katchi Abaddi in Islamabad.

The recent razing and eviction of the Katchi Abaddi in I-11 sector of Islamabad has raised massive outcry. The eviction has been dubbed by its critics as an attempt by the Capital Development Authority (CDA) as an opportunity to display its clout and might against the powerless.

On July 30, 2015, the Capital Development Authority (CDA), as per orders from the Islamabad High Court (IHC), demolished the 'Afghan *katchi basti*', on the directions of the interior ministry. In the face of protests and clashes with slum dwellers the CDA authority in collaboration with the Islamabad Capital Territory (ICT) administration, police and rangers, was able to successfully complete its four-day eviction drive.²⁷ While the

CDA can be hailed for its successful operation, some pertinent questions need to be addressed by the ICT administration; are the evictions in line with the National Housing Policy and the Katchi Abbadi Act of 2001? Additionally, is the National Housing Policy Framework clear enough on issues of housing and resettlement?

This eviction operation and subsequent development should serve as an eye opener for the Government as it is reflective of the larger issue of lack of needs assessment in preparation of housing plans by the City and District Governments.²⁸ It is also likely to have repercussions on the treatment of informal settlements, which includes up-gradation, relocation and development, in the future. Retrospectively, the absence of forward planning to deal with the problem of incremental and internally displaced populations could become a major governance challenge.

PILDAT believes that while there may be no doubt about the legitimacy of the evictions, the Government should have more clarity in its housing policy regarding the treatment of Katchi Abadis and informal settlements in order to avoid any civil unrest or instability on the issue. Moreover it will be judicious on the Government's part to ensure strict development controls in urban areas in order to prevent formation of new Katchi Abadis.

Promotions and Recruitments

Aitchison Principal Sacked for Rejecting Admissions

The recent sacking of Dr. Agha Ghazanfar, the Principal of the Aitchison College, Lahore, has raised serious concerns

26. "LeJ Leader, two sons, 12 other militants killed," DAWN Webpage: <http://www.dawn.com/news/1197227> . Accessed on 13/8/2015.

27. "CDA completes land eviction drive in I-11," Daily Times: <http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/islamabad/03-Aug-2015/cda-completes-land-eviction-drive-in-i11>

28. For Details see National Housing Policy 2001. "Housing plans to cater for the current and future housing needs for low income groups on incremental basis at affordable, cost. Moreover, Katchi Abadis resettlement plans and up-gradation plans shall be an integral part of these housing plans."

regarding the alleged use of intimidation and misuse of official position for the sake of pragmatism and self-interest. The principal was sacked on July 28, 2015 for apparently resisting nepotism under his watch and denying admission to influential bigwigs' children, which reportedly included grandson of Mr. Ayaz Sadiq, MNA, Speaker of the National Assembly, grandson of Mian Mansha, Industrialist, along with former Prime Minister Yousaf Raza Gilani's grandson.

The facts surrounding the case tend to support Dr. Ghazanfar's position. The entry examination this year included 486 registered candidates, 470 appeared for the test out of which top 140 were declared qualified for Kindergarten (K-2) admissions. Candidates who were denied admission during this process were those who obtained marks below the cut off score required to get in to K-2. The lists made public on the website leaves little room for speculation as to the merit of these candidates;²⁹ Grandsons of Sadiq, Gillani and Mansha scored around 40%, 18% and 19% respectively. Mr. Ghazanfar claims that he was repeatedly threatened and coerced into granting permission, despite the low scores of these candidates and upon refusal he was apprised that his decision would consequently end up in his removal as Principal of the Aitchison College. There is a lot of controversy surrounding the facts of this case, however, Mr. Ghazanfar has gone public with his views about the current Board of Governors of Aitchison College and has repeatedly claimed that the once prestigious college has not become a 'hotbed' for corruption and that despite a transparent admissions framework in place, authorities have failed to ensure merit based decisions.

PILDAT is concerned over the disappointing trend of nepotism and abuse of power and influence by Government Officials, however subsequent events show that the tide is changing and it's becoming more difficult to get away with political intimidation and corruption in the wake of greater transparency in decision-making. In the counter-attack by Dr. Ghazanfar, the Lahore High Court (LHC) issued notice to the Punjab Government and others for August 27 on a writ petition challenging³⁰ the appointment of Board of Governors and the changes made to the admission policy, which allegedly is not in compliance with the traditions of the school.

The concern regarding nepotism and political influence casting a wider net over other appointments is not ill-founded and is based on other recent appointment scandals which highlight the weaknesses of the system including judiciary and its inability to exert pressure to ensure that legislations in place are upheld and not amended based on pragmatism and nepotism.

Merit Being Ignored in Foreign Posting of Trade Officers

Another development in disregard of the merit-based selection policy is the recruitment of Trade Officers for postings on 3 lucrative foreign stations: Brussels, Geneva and Washington.³¹ A special selection board, headed by the Commerce Minister, Mr. Khurram Dastgir Khan, MNA, was formed to interview a panel of bureaucrats. The selection board forwarded a panel of 9 candidates to the Prime Minister for final approval. The summary given by the PM Secretariat revealed that that two major changes were made contrary to the recommendations put forth by the selection committee. Mr. Ilyas Ghauri, Punjab's Board of Investment and Trade CEO was recommended as Economic Minister for Brussels. However the PM secretariat dropped Mr. Ghauri as a contender and replaced him with Mr. Tariq Vikar Bakhshi who is the son-in-law of the Chief Election Commissioner of Pakistan and allegedly does not have the required expertise in the field of Economics. Moreover, Mr. Bakhshi was posted as permanent Deputy Representative for World Trade Organization (WTO) Geneva.³² Despite the rigorous selection criteria developed, postings for Brussels, Geneva and Washington were to be made only after an interview, as per the subsequent amendments to the policy.

According to the new policy approved in February 2015 recruitments of Trade Officers requires applicants to obtain at least 60 % marks in tests which are to be conducted externally by the Lahore University of Management Sciences (LUMS). The weightage of the test was also revised to 80% from the previous 20%.³³ Furthermore the tenure of Trade Officers has been changed from a single three-year non-extendable term to an extendable two-year term. People have heavily criticized this, since it is likely to provide legal cover to officers who have been posted abroad for several years.

29. "Aitchison Principal Sacked for Defying the Mighty," The Nation. July 29 2015. <http://nation.com.pk/national/29-Jul-2015/aitchison-principal-sacked-for-defying-the-mighty>

30. "The Sacking of a Principal," Anwer Mooraj. August 2 2015. The Express Tribune Webpage: <http://tribune.com.pk/story/930591/the-sacking-of-a-principal/>

31. "Merit being ignored in foreign posting of trade officers," DAWN. July 22 2015. Webpage: <http://www.dawn.com/news/1195515> . Accessed on 13/8/2015.

32. Ibid

33. "Political Appointees," DAWN: <http://www.dawn.com/news/1199494> . Accessed on 18/08/2015.

This policy was amended several times and quickly revised to accommodate favoritism in the selection process. Postings at lucrative stations like Washington Brussels and Geneva were left to the discretion of the Government. PML-N has been very vocal in the past regarding political interference in appointments, however the amendments made to the rigorous selection process are not reflective of that.

Disaster Management & Climate Preparedness

NDMA Efforts in on-going Monsoon Floods

On July 16, 2015, Chitral was hit by the Glacial Lake Outbursts, which carried massive torrents and flash floods. It washed away villages, roads, bridges, drinking water supply systems, micro hydel power channels, public/private property and agricultural crops. The flood has also damaged 180 buildings including houses, shops and hotels in Chitral while destroying another 15 bridges and 12 roads.³⁴ Additionally, 244 villages in Punjab were hit including 39 houses.³⁵



Heavy rains caused flooding and damage in various parts of Chitral Valley.

Taking a stock of the National Disaster Management Authority (NDMA) with regards to disaster management and post disaster relief work undertaken so far, the NDMA responded in a timely fashion, with the joint efforts of District and Provincial Authorities and the support of the Pakistan Army. NDMA was also able to mobilize and facilitate the KP Provincial Disaster Management Authority (PDMA) by sending food packages to affected families.³⁶ Provincial and District Administration are also taking steps to restore water supply and arrange for temporary basic service delivery mechanisms. Despite the timely relief efforts, the casualties resulting from floods and earthquakes every year is disturbing, which is a cause of concern for Provincial Governments, since it often escalates in to a larger governance crisis.

Significant apprehensions remain regarding ability of the Provincial and District Governments to assess needs and gaps of relief efforts and disaster response. There is also a need for better contingency planning and preventive response in the face of rapidly changing climatic conditions and weather anomalies. Additionally, there is also the question of lack of political will. Several workshops and consultations have been held by the Federal Flood Commission (FFC) to devise a broad-based national plan for protection against floods, during the next 10 years and preparedness for monsoon season 2015,³⁷ however the flood mitigation strategy in place is inadequate to deal with floods caused by rapidly changing climatic conditions. PILDAT wants to encourage the Government to undertake initiatives geared towards conservation and storage of water. The Ministry of Water and Power along with its attached departments like FFC and WAPDA; responsible for overall flood management and impact mitigation efforts should ensure that an integrated multi-sectoral flood management plan is in place, woven in to the National Water Policy framework of Pakistan so that 'regular flooding' can be used as a resource.³⁸

34. "Flood Kills 13 in different parts of Pakistan," *The Express Tribune*: <http://tribune.com.pk/story/924301/pm-leaves-for-chitral-to-monitor-relief-activities/>

35. "Pakistan-Floods (ECHO Daily Flash of 26 July 2015)," Reliefweb: <http://reliefweb.int/report/pakistan/pakistan-floods-echo-daily-flash-26-july-2015>

36. For details see the National Disaster Management Authority. Government of Pakistan. <http://www.ndma.gov.pk/new/newsroom/news2015.php>

37. "National Flood Protection Plan Discussed," *The Nation*: <http://nation.com.pk/islamabad/13-Jan-2015/national-flood-protection-plan-discussed> . Accessed on 13/8/2015

38. "Developing an Integrated Flood Management Plan," Punjab Government. Chapter 9. <http://punjab.gov.pk/sites/punjab.pitb.gov.pk/files/Ch9.pdf>. Accessed on 18/08/2015.

Karachi Heat Wave



Outside Jinnah Postgraduate Medical Centre (JPMC) during the Heat Wave in Karachi

Apart from the devastation caused by floods, the month of June in Pakistan also witnessed a total of 1000 deaths due to one of the worst heat waves to have struck Karachi. These deaths elucidate the grave water shortage as well as administrative problems that the province of Sindh is facing as 60-65% of people don't have access to clean drinking water. Additionally, the mismanagement and inadequate administration in hospitals was highlighted when hundreds of patients were turned away due to shortage of hospital beds, last month.³⁹

The Information Minister of Sindh, Mr. Sharjeel Memon, MPA, held Karachi Electric (KE) and the Ministry of Water and Power responsible for the

resulting casualties. He said that poor performance of the power supply company caused mass casualties in Karachi and cases will be lodged against both the institutions in its wake.

On July 16, 2015, the National Electric Power Regulatory Authority (NEPRA) formally accused the Karachi Electric (KE) of widespread violations of its privatization agreement and license conditions and announced that it is initiating regulatory proceedings against the utility. The Federal Minister on one hand washed his hands off saying that this is a private sector issue and does not require federal oversight. This sheds light on the widening gaps between the public and the private sector and the lack of collaborative efforts during times of crises like these. Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif on the other hand said, "This was unprecedented in the history of Pakistan and all departments who shirked their responsibilities, adding to public misery should be held accountable in a transparent manner."⁴⁰ In addition to expressing his grief and sorrow, the Prime Minister also ordered a transparent inquiry into heat wave deaths. However, this is likely to be empty rhetoric, since the Government has failed to elaborate further on the terms of reference of this inquiry or communicate any deadlines.⁴¹

Despite displays of Government's disappointment at the mismanagement during the heat wave, the loss of life cannot be reversed, but can serve as an eye opener for the administration. PILDAT condemns the lack of Government oversight and preparedness to deal with the heat wave. The casualties resulting from it present a dismal portrait of the governance structure in place to deal with major climate disasters.

Performance of Regulatory Bodies

Crackdown Against Eateries Continues in Punjab

During the recent months, PILDAT has observed a welcome activism and dynamism in the efforts of the Punjab Food Authority (PFA) and its Director Ms. Ayesha Mumtaz in ensuring better hygienic conditions and quality of food in restaurants across Punjab.⁴²

39. "Updated: Heatwave death toll in Karachi reaches 1260," ARY News Webpage: <http://arynews.tv/en/mercury-still-at-38-degrees-in-karachi> . Accessed on 13/8/2015.

40. "All institutions responsible for Karachi heat wave death," The Nation Webpage: <http://nation.com.pk/national/01-Jul-2015/all-institutions-responsible-for-karachi-heat-wave-death-pm>

41. "Federal government inquiry into heat wave deaths ordered," DAWN. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1190648> . Accessed on 19/08/2015

42. "Eateries run in trouble as PFA exposes health risks," The Express Tribune: <http://tribune.com.pk/story/930735/eateries-run-into-trouble-as-pfa-exposes-health-risks/>

The PFA has inspected about 5,500 outlets and sealed around 250 up till now. Apart from this, improvement notices have been served on around 2,500 restaurants. These include some of the most well-known and posh eateries of the city such as the Pearl Continental and Avari hotels. On July 30th 2015, Chief Minister Shahbaz Sharif gave the go ahead to expand the Punjab Food Authority's operations to eight cities in the province. He also approved proposed amendments to the Punjab Food Authority Act of 2011, aimed at expanding the scope of PFA to Rawalpindi, Faisalabad, Gujranwala, Sargodha, Multan, Bahawalpur, Sialkot, and Murree.⁴³

PILDAT believes continuation of the crackdown and expanding the scope of PFA operations to other districts will improve the quality of food served at restaurants and will force food industry to comply with better hygiene standards. Pakistan has had a food authority for decades but it has only come into visibility now. This should be a learning experience and should serve as a wake up call to all other regulatory bodies that have been lying dormant and only exist in name.

43. "CM approves amendments to Punjab Food Authority Act . July 31, 2015. <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-5-331651-CM-approves-amendment-to-Punjab-Food-Authority-Act>. Accessed 19/8/2015.